Supplemental Table 1. Characteristics of Participants for Prototypic and Comorbid Cases.

	Prototypic Cases	Comorbid Cases	Comorbid Cases
		DSM Condition	FFM Condition
	19.84	20.52	18.53
Years of Experience and (SD)	(8.85)	(8.98)	(8.82)
	31.84	33.86	33.40
Clinical Working Hours per Week and (SD)	(11.83)	(13.21)	(13.15)
	10.88	10.97	12.30
Hours/Week with Pers. Disorder Patients and (SD)	(8.13)	(9.91)	(10.70)
Gender			
Male	45.99%	46.32%	41.67%
Female	50.27%	49.47%	57.29%
No Response	3.74%	4.21%	1.04%
Degree			
Ph.D.	29.14%	28.42%	30.21%
Psy.D.	6.95%	4.21%	1.04%
M.D.	30.21%	32.63%	34.38%
Masters or	28.34%	24.21%	26.04%
higher in S.W.			
Unspecified Masters	2.67%	6.32%	8.33%
Other or Unknown	2.67%	4.21%	0.00%
Theoretical Orientation			
Cognitive or Cognitive-Behavioral	61.5%	70.5%	64.6%
Psychodynamic	55.1%	61.1%	47.9%
Interpersonal/System	36.9%	39.0%	37.5%
Eclectic	35.3%	22.1%	34.4%
Biological	33.7%	35.8%	35.4%

Е	Behavioral	29.4%	21.1%	27.1%
H	Humanistic	16.6%	13.7%	13.5%
F	Psychoanalytic	12.8%	14.7%	8.3%
C	Other	12.8%	15.8%	4.2%
Em	ployment Setting			
F	Private Practice	70.0%	75.8%	70.8%
H	Hopsital	31.6%	29.5%	38.5%
C	Clinic	31.0%	25.3%	26.0%
A	Academic Position	21.9%	29.5%	28.1%
F	Forensics	9.6%	9.5%	9.4%
C	Other	16.6%	19.0%	11.5%

Supplemental Table 2. Mean Number of Correct Diagnoses per Personality Disorder for Prototypic Cases.

Pers. Disorder	FFM	DSM	SWAP
Cluster A			
Paranoid	0.43	1.00	0.80
Schizoid	0.65	0.88	0.58
Schizotypal	0.34	0.59	0.69
Cluster B			
Antisocial	0.50	0.95	0.87
Borderline	0.41	0.95	0.94
Histrionic	0.29	0.78	0.56
Narcissistic	0.56	0.94	0.95
Cluster C			
Avoidant	0.35	0.61	0.50
Dependent	0.53	0.82	0.82
OCPD	0.75	0.89	0.88

Supplemental Table 3. Mean Number of Incorrect Diagnoses per Personality Disorder for Prototypic Cases.

Pers. Disorder	FFM	DSM	SWAP
Cluster A			
Paranoid	1.09	0.25	0.55
Schizoid	1.24	0.41	0.74
Schizotypal	1.05	1.41	0.88
Cluster B			
Antisocial	1.00	0.25	1.04
Borderline	0.94	0.16	0.47
Histrionic	1.24	0.58	0.89
Narcissistic	0.81	0.20	0.25
Cluster C			
Avoidant	1.55	1.13	1.20
Dependent	1.37	0.47	0.47
OCPD	0.80	0.28	0.30

Supplemental Figures 1a-c. Profiles and Diagnoses of the Three Comorbid Cases in both the DSM and FFM Conditions

Note: The disorders shown in brackets associated with each *DSM* symptom were not presented to participants. The FFM profiles presented to participants looked like Figure 1a.

#### Supplemental Figure 1a: Earnest

DSM Profile	FFM Profile	
Avoids occupational activities that involve significant	Neuroticism Facets	
interpersonal contact, because of fears of criticism,	Anxiousness	4.33
disapproval, or rejection. [Avoidant]	Angry Hostility	3.50
Is inhibited in new interpersonal situations because of	Depressiveness	4.07
feelings of inadequacy. [Avoidant]	Self-consciousness	4.54
Reads hidden demeaning or threatening meanings into	Impulsivity	1.85
benign remarks or events. [Paranoid]	Vulnerability	3.76
Almost always chooses solitary activities. [Schizoid]	Extraversion Facets	3.70
Views self as socially inept, personally unappealing, or	Warmth	1.84
inferior to others. [Avoidant]	Gregariousness	1.47
Is unwilling to get involved with people unless certain of being liked. [Avoidant]	Assertiveness	1.60
Shows restraint within intimate relationships because of the	Activity	2.00
fear of being shamed or ridiculed. [Avoidant]	Excitement-Seeking	1.52
Is preoccupied with being criticized or rejected in social	Positive Emotions	1.69
situations. [Avoidant]	Openness Facets	1.05
Lacks close friends or confidents other than first-degree	Fantasy	4.07
relatives. [Schizoid & Schizotypal]	Aesthetics	3.00
Has little, if any, interest in having sexual experiences with	Feelings	2.59
another person. [Schizoid]	Actions	2.79
Is unusually reluctant to take personal risks or to engage in	Ideas	3.14
<pre>any new activities because they may prove embarrassing. [Avoidant]</pre>	Values	1.93
Neither desires nor enjoys close relationships, including	Agreeableness Facets	1.55
being part of a family. [Schizoid]	Trust	1.88
being part of a family. [beingoing]	Straightforwardness	3.01
	Altruism	2.85
	Compliance	3.27
	Modesty	3.83
	Tendermindedness	3.13
	Conscientious Facets	3.13
	Competence	3.71
	Order	3.64
	Dutifulness	3.71
	Achievement Striving	3.75
	Self-Discipline	3.69
	Deliberation	3.97

## Participant's Diagnoses from the DSM Profile

## Correct Diagnoses Avoidant 63% Schizoid 42% Incorrect Diagnoses > 10% Social Anxiety 19% Paranoid 14%

## Participant's Diagnoses from the FFM Profile

32%
16%
28%
20 /0
23%
20%

### Supplemental Figure 1b: Madeline

DSM I	Profile	FFM Profile	
Requires excessive admiration	. [Narcissistic]	Neuroticism Facets	
Interaction with others is ofter		Anxiousness	2.28
inappropriate sexually sedu	ctive or provocative behavior.	Angry Hostility	3.41
[Histrionic]		Depressiveness	2.24
Impulsivity in at least two area		Self-consciousness	1.28
	sex, substance abuse, reckless	Impulsivity	4.08
driving, binge eating). Note		Vulnerability	2.00
self-mutilating behavior. [Bo		Extraversion Facets	
Inappropriate, intense anger o		Warmth	2.26
(e.g., frequent displays of to		Gregariousness	4.56
recurrent physical fights). [ Shows arrogant, haughty beha		Assertiveness	4.69
[Narcissistic]	aviors or attitudes.	Activity	4.72
Lacks empathy: is unwilling to	recognize or identify with the	Excitement-Seeking	4.74
feelings and needs of others		Positive Emotions	4.19
There is evidence of Conduct D		Openness Facets	7.13
15 years. [Antisocial]	3	Fantasy	2.65
Consistently uses physical app	earance to draw attention to	Aesthetics	2.82
self. [Histrionic]		Feelings	2.15
Considers relationships to be n	nore intimate than they	Actions	4.14
actually are. [Histrionic]			
Is preoccupied with fantasies of		Ideas Values	3.19
brilliance, beauty, or ideal lo			4.28
Is interpersonally exploitative,		Agreeableness Facets	2 1 4
others to achieve his or her		Trust	2.14
Identity disturbance: markedly		Straightforwardness	1.77
self-image or sense of self. A pattern of unstable and inter		Altruism	2.22
characterized by alternating		Compliance	1.69
idealization and devaluation		Modesty	1.27
Is uncomfortable in situations		Tendermindedness	1.60
center of attention.		Conscientious Facets	
Affective instability due to a m	arked reactivity of mood (e.g.,	Competence	4.35
intense episodicdysphoria, i	rritability, or anxiety usually	Order	3.64
	y rarely more than a few days.	Dutifulness	3.00
[Borderline]		Achievement Striving	4.74
Shows self-dramatization, thea		Self-Discipline	3.51
expression of emotion. [His		aDeliberation	2.24
Has a grandiose sense of self-i			
achievements and talents, e	•		
superior without commensu [Narcissistic]	nate achievements).		
[Natel3313tic]			
Participant's Diagnos	es	Participant's Diagnose	es
from the DSM Profile		from the FFM Profile	
Correct Diagnoses		Correct Diagnoses	
Borderline	68%	Borderline	11%
Histrionic	46%	Histrionic	11%
Narcissistic	59%	Narcissistic	26%
Incorrect Diagnoses > 10%	55 /6	Incorrect Diagnoses > 10%	20 /0
Antisocial, Sociopathic or		Antisocial, Sociopathic or	_
Psychopathic	39%	Psychopathic	34%
. 5, 6, 6, 6, 6, 6, 6, 6, 6, 6, 6, 6, 6, 6,		Bipolar or Manic	22%
			,0

### Supplemental Figure 1c: Ted

DSM Profile	FFM Profile	
Lacks empathy: is unwilling to recognize or identify with the	Neuroticism Facets	
feelings and needs of others. [Narcissistic]	Anxiousness	1.49
Has a grandiose sense of self-importance (e.g., exaggerates	Angry Hostility	4.14
achievements and talents, expects to be recognized as	Depressiveness	2.12
superior without commensurate achievements).	Self-consciousness	1.38
[Narcissistic]	Impulsivity	2.84
Shows arrogant, haughty behaviors or attitudes.	Vulnerability	1.58
[Narcissistic]	Extraversion Facets	1.50
Deceitfulness, as indicated by repeated lying, use of aliases,	Warmth	1.95
or conning others for personal profit or pleasure. [Antisocial]	Gregariousness	3.45
Neither desires nor enjoys close relationships, including	Assertiveness	4.08
being part of a family. [Schizoid]	Activity	4.10
Has a sense of entitlement, i.e., unreasonable expectations	Excitement-Seeking	4.10
of especially favorable treatment or automatic compliance	Positive Emotions	3.11
with his or her expectations. [Narcissistic]	Openness Facets	3.11
Lacks close friends or confidants other than first-degree	Fantasy	3.03
relatives. [Schizoid & Schizotypal]	Aesthetics	3.22
Reckless disregard for safety of self or others. [Antisocial]		2.08
Failure to conform to social norms with respect to lawful	Feelings	3.85
behaviors as indicated by repeatedly performing acts that	Actions	3.88
are grounds for arrest. [Antisocial]	Ideas	2.75
Lack of remorse, as indicated by being indifferent to or	Values	2./5
rationalizing having hurt, mistreated, or stolen from	Agreeableness Facets	1 71
another. [Antisocial]	Trust	1.71
Believes that he or she is "special" and unique and can only be understood by, or should associate with, other special	Straightforwardness	1.16
or high-status people (or institutions). [Narcissistic]	Altruism	1.27
Is interpersonally exploitative, i.e., takes advantage of	Compliance	1.88
others to achieve his or her own ends. [Narcissistic]	Modesty	1.40
Irritability and aggressiveness, as indicated by repeated	Tendermindedness	1.25
physical fights or assaults. [Antisocial]	Conscientious Facets	
	Competence	4.33
	Order	4.48
	Dutifulness	3.36
	Achievement Striving	4.00
	Self-Discipline	3.41
	Deliberation	3.93
Participant's Diagnoses	Participant's Diagno	oses
from the DSM Profile	from the FFM Prof	ile
Correct Diagnoses	Correct Diagnoses	

# Correct Diagnoses Antisocial 79% Narcissistic 58% Incorrect Diagnoses > 10% Sociopathic or Psychopathic (can be mapped onto 12% Antisocial)

Correct Diagnoses	
Antisocial	26%
Narcissistic	23%
Incorrect Diagnoses > 10%	
Obsessive-Compulsive	30%
Pers. D. or D.	30 /0
Paranoid	16%
Bipolar or Manic	13%

Familiarity with DSM as a Covariate in Study 2

One explanation why participants in the DSM condition reported slightly higher familiarity with the DSM-IV than participants in the FFM condition is that they may have been reminded of the DSM criterial symptoms while looking at the DSM case profiles. In contrast, participants in the FFM condition may have felt less familiar with the DSM after having a difficult time providing correct DSM diagnoses. We ran additional statistical analyses using familiarity with the DSM-IV as a covariate and these analyses confirmed that the difference in familiarity did not lead to any of the main findings in Study 2. These findings are presented below.

Correct Diagnoses. Though familiarity with the DSM was a significant predictor of the overall accuracy score, F(1,187)=5.15, p=.02, the effect of DSM vs. FFM was still significant as well, F(1,187)=147.95, p<.01.

Incorrect Diagnoses. An ANOVA using familiarity with the DSM as a covariate, did not find familiarity with the DSM to be a significant predictor of the number of incorrect diagnoses F(1,187)<1, and the effect of DSM vs. FFM was still significant F(1,187)=19.84, p<.01.

Utility Ratings. Familiarity with the DSM was a significant predictor of all six utility questions (all p's<.05). However, even with DSM as a covariate, participants still gave significantly higher utility ratings for DSM than FFM for five of the six utility questions (all p's<.05). For the question about communicating with clients, even after accounting for familiarity with the DSM, the average utility rating was still higher for FFM than DSM as was found in the initial analysis, (p=.05).